

# Wine and Wine Service Occupations Labor Market Information Report

Prepared by the San Francisco Bay Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research May 2018

#### Recommendation

Based on all available data, there appears to be a significant undersupply of Wine and Wine Service workers compared to the demand for this cluster of occupations in the Bay region and in the SC-Monterey sub-region (Monterey, San Benito and Santa Cru Counties). Calculating an exact traditional LMI gap does not seem to add any value to the decision to create a Wine Service program, since 89% of the annual openings and 83% of the 2022 jobs for the selected occupational cluster are for bartenders, waitresses and waiters, who do not necessarily need a Wine Service certificate or degree to perform the job.

It would seem that the most important information to consider is whether or not local and regional employers are expressing a need for their employees to have these skills. There does not seem to be any issue on the demand side as long as employers (and consequently students who wanted to add a new skill that is valued to advance or increase employment opportunities) saw value in getting a certificate in wine education. There is some data in Table 9 of this report that indicates employers are seeking skills such as "product sales" and "upselling products and services" related to the cluster of occupations selected.

This report also provides student outcomes data on employment and earnings for programs on TOP 1306.00 - Nutrition, Foods, and Culinary Arts in the state and region. It is recommended that this data be reviewed to better understand how outcomes for students taking courses on this TOP code compare to potentially similar programs at colleges in the state and region, as well as to outcomes across all CTE programs at Cabrillo College and at Monterey Peninsula College and in the region.

#### Introduction

This report profiles Wine and Wine Service Occupations in the 12 county Bay region and in the SC-Monterey subregion. Cabrillo College and Monterey Peninsula College (MPC) are considering developing a collaborative certificate in wine education. One-hour commute ranges for both colleges are also used as sub-regions. Traditional LMI is only available at the six-digit SOC code level. However, information from Burning Glass is available at the eight-digit level for the online job postings tables in the report.

• Food Service Managers (SOC 11-9051): Plan, direct, or coordinate activities of an organization or department that serves food and beverages.

Entry-Level Educational Requirement: Bachelor's degree

Training Requirement: None

Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 37%

• Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products (SOC 13-1022): Buy merchandise or commodities, other than farm products, for resale to consumers at the wholesale or retail level, including both durable and nondurable goods. Analyze past buying trends, sales records, price, and quality of merchandise to determine value and yield. Select, order, and authorize payment for merchandise according to contractual agreements. May conduct meetings with sales personnel and introduce new products. Includes assistant wholesale and retail

Entry-Level Educational Requirement: Bachelor's degree

Training Requirement: Moderate-term on-the-job training

Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 35%

Agricultural and Food Science Technicians (SOC 19-4011): Work with agricultural and food scientists in food, fiber, and animal research, production, and processing; and assist with animal breeding and nutrition. Conduct tests and experiments to improve yield and quality of crops or to increase the resistance of plants and animals to disease or insects. Includes technicians who assist food scientists or technologists in the research and development of production technology, quality control, packaging, processing, and use of foods.

 Food Science Technicians (SOC 19-4011.02): Perform standardized qualitative and quantitative tests to determine physical or chemical properties of food or beverage products.

Entry-Level Educational Requirement: Associate's degree

Training Requirement: Moderate-term on-the-job training

Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 39%

• Bartenders (SOC 35-3011): Mix and serve drinks to patrons, directly or through waitstaff.

Entry-Level Educational Requirement: No formal educational credential

Training Requirement: Short-term on-the-job training

Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 46%

• Waiters and Waitresses (SOC 35-3031): Take orders and serve food and beverages to patrons at tables in dining establishment. Excludes "Counter Attendants, Cafeteria, Food Concession, and Coffee Shop" (35-3022).

Entry-Level Educational Requirement: No formal educational credential

Training Requirement: Short-term on-the-job training

Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 39%

# **Occupational Demand**

Table 1. Employment Outlook for Wine and Wine Service Occupations in Bay Region

Occupation	2017 Jobs	2022 Jobs	5-Yr Change	5-Yr % Change	5-Yr Open-ings	Annual Open- ings	10% Hourly Wage	Median Hourly Wage
Food Service Managers	12,916	13,848	932	7%	7,957	1,591	\$9.81	\$18.24
Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products	5,378	5,602	225	4%	3,313	663	\$14.31	\$24.90
Agricultural and Food Science Technicians	1,136	1,193	57	5%	634	127	\$13.08	\$22.79
Bartenders	19,246	21,849	2,603	14%	19,292	3,858	\$10.51	\$13.87
Waiters and Waitresses	74,241	81,018	6,777	9%	79,364	15,873	\$10.22	\$13.66
Total	112,916	123,510	10,594	9%	110,561	22,112	\$10.45	\$14.85

Source: EMSI 2018.2

Bay Region includes Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, Monterey, Napa, San Benito, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Santa Cruz, Solano and Sonoma Counties

Table 2a. Employment Outlook for Wine & Wine Service Occupations in One-Hour Commute Range from Cabrillo College

Occupation	201 <i>7</i> Jobs	2022 Jobs	5-Yr Change	5-Yr % Change	5-Yr Open- ings	Annual Open- ings	10% Hourly Wage	Median Hourly Wage
Food Service Managers	3,775	4,046	271	7%	2,344	469	\$9.83	\$1 <i>7.</i> 79
Wholesale and Retail Buyers,  Except Farm Products  Wine and Wine Service Occupation	1,916	,	40 Region and		, .	229	\$12.46	\$22.74

Agricultural and Food Science Technicians	479	498	19	4%	264	53	\$11.82	\$23.10
Bartenders	4,551	5,122	571	13%	4,501	900	\$10.28	\$13.30
Waiters and Waitresses	22,445	24,232	1,787	8%	23,610	4,722	\$10.25	\$13.18
TOTAL	33,167	35,854	2,687	8%	31,866	6,373	\$10.36	\$14.42

Source: EMSI 2018.2

One hour commute range includes 159 zip codes within a typical one hour commute from Cabrillo College in Aptos

Table 2b. Employment Outlook for Wine and Wine Service Occupations in SC-Monterey Sub-Region

Occupation	201 <i>7</i> Jobs	2022 Jobs	5-Yr Change	5-Yr % Change	5-Yr Open- ings	Annual Open- ings	10% Hourly Wage	Median Hourly Wage
Food Service Managers	1,035	1,090	55	5%	614	123	\$9.79	\$16.99
Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products	304	299	(6)	(2%)	1 <i>7</i> 0	34	\$13.1 <i>7</i>	\$20.82
Agricultural & Food Science Technicians	186	193	7	4%	101	20	\$10.15	\$19.54
Bartenders	1,295	1,414	119	9%	1,220	244	\$10.01	\$12.18
Waiters and Waitresses	6,093	6,468	374	6%	6,248	1,250	\$10.01	\$13.24
TOTAL	8,913	9,463	549	6%	8,352	1,671	\$10.09	\$13.92

Source: EMSI 2018.2

SC-Monterey Sub-Region includes Monterey, San Benito and Santa Cruz Counties

Table 2c. Employment Outlook for Wine & Wine Service Occupations in One-Hour Commute Range from MPC

Occupation	201 <i>7</i> Jobs	2022 Jobs	5-Yr Change	5-Yr % Change	5-Yr Open- ings	Annual Open- ings	10% Hourly Wage	Median Hourly Wage
Food Service Managers	1,118	1,1 <i>7</i> 9	61	5%	673	135	\$9.83	\$1 <i>7</i> .29
Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products	388	385	(3)	(1%)	224	45	\$13.03	\$21.54
Agricultural & Food Science Technicians	200	205	5	3%	109	22	\$10.23	\$20.03
Bartenders	1,386	1,518	132	10%	1,313	263	\$10.01	\$12.33
Waiters and Waitresses	6,647	7,065	418	6%	6,830	1,366	\$10.02	\$13.25
TOTAL	9,739	10,352	613	6%	9,148	1,830	\$10.12	\$14.05

Source: EMSI 2018.2

One hour commute range includes 54 zip codes within a typical one hour commute from MPC in Monterey

#### Job Postings in Bay Region and SC-Monterey Sub-Region

Table 3. Number of Job Postings by Occupation for latest 12 months (May 2017 - April 2018)

Occupation	Bay Region	Four Counties*	Three Counties
Food Service Managers (11-9051.00)	5,282	1,419	275
Waiters and Waitresses (35-3031.00)	3,087	966	295
Bartenders (35-3011.00)	1,164	335	93
Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products (13-1022.00)	129	23	2
Food Science Technicians (19-4011.02)	51	15	1
Total	9,713	2,758	666

Source: Burning Glass

Table 4. Top Job Titles for Wine and Wine Service Occupations for latest 12 months (May 2017 - April 2018)

<sup>\*</sup>Burning Glass does not have the capability to filter job postings at the zip code level. Therefore, for the one hour commute range, Santa Clara County was added to the three counties in the SC-Monterey sub-region to make the four counties sub-region.

Bartender	1,045	278	91	Food Server	152	38	1 <i>7</i>
Restaurant Manager	971	305	57	Service Manager	136	24	0
Assistant Manager	636	183	25	Cocktail Server	107	42	13
Server	611	214	49	Servers	97	22	1
General Manager	551	138	35	Department Manager	81	22	7
Restaurant General Manager	287	90	13	Busser	79	14	4
Kitchen Manager	265	68	9	Banquet Manager	76	12	2
Wait Staff	250	79	14	Food Service Manager	74	10	0
Banquet Server	247	79	32	Food and Beverage Manager	69	20	5
Restaurant Server	238	66	20	Director of Catering	62	9	3
Assistant Restaurant Manager	220	71	20	Sourcing Specialist	60	8	2
Shift Manager	206	58	29	Manager, Food Service Industry	59	12	4
Food Runner	191	40	1 <i>7</i>	Catering Manager	58	22	6
Manager	178	20	2	Chef Manager	54	22	3

Source: Burning Glass

# **Industry Concentration**

Table 5. Industries hiring Wine and Wine Service Workers in Bay Region

Industry — 6 Digit NAICS (No. American Industry Classification) Codes	Jobs in Industry (2017)	Jobs in Industry (2022)	% Change (2017-22)	% in Industry (2017)
Full-Service Restaurants (722511)	69,551	75,876	9%	61.6%
Drinking Places (Alcoholic Beverages) (722410)	6,341	7,430	17%	5.6%
Hotels (except Casino Hotels) and Motels (721110)	6,182	6,405	4%	5.5%
Limited-Service Restaurants (722513)	4 <b>,</b> 317	4,556	6%	3.8%
Food Service Contractors (722310)	3,424	3,823	12%	3.0%
Caterers (722320)	2,896	3,355	16%	2.6%
Civic and Social Organizations (813410)	1,759	1,915	9%	1.6%
Snack and Nonalcoholic Beverage Bars (722515)	1,472	1,663	13%	1.3%
Wineries (312130)	1,156	1,231	6%	1.0%
Corporate, Subsidiary, and Regional Managing Offices (551114)	1,145	1,153	1%	1.0%

Source: EMSI 2018.2

Table 6. Top Employers Posting Wine and Wine Service Occupations in Bay and SC-Monterey (May 2017 - April 2018)

Employer	Bay	Employer	4 Counties	Employer	3 Counties
Marriott International Inc	501	Hyatt	111	Destination Hotels & Resorts	64
Chipotle Mexican Grill	314	Hilton Hotel Corporation	84	Hyatt	63
McDonald's	266	Destination Hotels & Resorts	82	Hilton Hotel Corporation	33
Hilton Hotel Corporation	245	McDonald's	79	McDonald's	30
Bjs Restaurants Inc	228	Aramark	70	Marriott International Inc	28
Hyatt	188	Chipotle Mexican Grill	65	Aramark	18
Aramark	165	Marriott International Inc	61	Sanctuary Beach Resort	18
Interstate Hotels & Resorts	146	Bjs Restaurants Incorporated	54	Bjs Restaurants Inc	16
Applebee's	143	Compass Group	45	Buffalo Wild Wings	16
Buffalo Wild Wings	113	Sodexo ns in 12 County Bay Region an	d in SC-Monte	Carmel Valley Ranch Resort	14 se <b>4</b> of

Destination Hotels & Resorts	110	Denny's	41	Denny's	14
Panda Express	110	Buffalo Wild Wings	38	Big Sur Lodge	12
Sodexo	98	P.F. Chang's	37	KFC	11
Panera Bread	91	Brinker International	36	Ventana Inn And Spa	11
Benihana	87	The Cheesecake Factory	36	Hhm	10
The Cheesecake Factory	84	Chili's	31	Pebble Beach Resorts	10
Brinker International	77	Red Robin Gourmet Burgers	29	Bpr Properties	9

Source: Burning Glass

# **Educational Supply**

There are three colleges in the Bay Region issuing 25 awards annually on TOP 1306.00 - Nutrition, Foods, and Culinary Arts. There are five other educational institutions issuing 426 awards annually on the three CIP codes cross-walked to TOP 1306.00 - Nutrition, Foods & Culinary Arts: CIP 12.0501 Baking & Pastry Arts/Baker/Pastry Chef, CIP 12.0503 Culinary Arts/Chef Training and CIP 12.0599 Culinary Arts & Related Services, Other for a total of 451 awards annually in the region. No colleges in the Santa Cruz-Monterey sub-region are issuing awards on TOP 1306.00.

Table 7. Awards on TOP 1306.00 - Nutrition, Foods, and Culinary Arts or on CIP 12.0501 Baking and Pastry Arts/Baker/Pastry Chef or CIP 12.0503 Culinary Arts/Chef Training or CIP 12.0599 Culinary Arts & Related Services, Other in Bay Region

22 22, 2 2 22, 23						
College	Sub-Region	CIP Code	Headcount	Associates	Certificates	Total
Cabrillo	SC-Monterey	n/a	25	0	0	0
Canada	Mid-Peninsula	n/a	195	1	0	1
Chabot	East Bay	n/a	<i>7</i> 81	0	0	0
Contra Costa	East Bay	n/a	69	0	0	0
De Anza	Silicon Valley	n/a	1 <i>,</i> 788	0	0	0
Diablo Valley	East Bay	n/a	1,470	0	2	2
Evergreen Valley	Silicon Valley	n/a	392	0	0	0
Hartnell	SC-Monterey	n/a	255	0	0	0
Las Positas	East Bay	n/a	821	0	0	0
Los Medanos	East Bay	n/a	394	0	0	0
Marin	North Bay	n/a	100	0	0	0
Mission	Silicon Valley	n/a	398	0	0	0
Monterey	SC-Monterey	n/a	446	0	0	0
Napa Valley	North Bay	n/a	14	0	0	0
San Francisco	Mid-Peninsula	n/a	323	0	22	22
San Mateo	Mid-Peninsula	n/a	406	0	0	0
San Jose City	Silicon Valley	n/a	180	0	0	0
Santa Rosa	North Bay	n/a	1,512	0	0	0
Skyline	Mid-Peninsula	n/a	100	0	0	0
Solano	North Bay	n/a	1,110	0	0	0
West Valley	Silicon Valley	n/a	351	0	0	0
Argosy University-The Art Institute	44: LB : L	12.0501	n/a	17	0	1 <i>7</i>
of CA-SF	Mid-Peninsula	12.0503	n/a	25	3	28
Argosy University-The Art Institute	Ciliana Vallar	12.0501	n/a	7	2	9
of CA-Silicon Valley	Silicon Valley	12.0503	n/a	19	2	20
CET-Sobrato*	Silicon Valley	12.0599	n/a	0	31	31
	Cilia a sa Marilla	12.0501	n/a	0	33	33
International Culinary Center-CA	Silicon Valley	12.0503	n/a	0	79	79
Le Cordon Bleu College of Culinary	AAt al. Danita and	12.0501	n/a	8	53	61
Arts-SF	/via-reninsula	12.0503	n/a	60	88	148
Total Bay Region			11,103	137	315	451
Total SC-Monterey Sub-Region			726	0	0	0
3, 3						

Source: IPEDS, Data Mart and Launchboard

NOTE: Headcount of students who took one or more courses is for 2016-17. The annual average for awards is 2014-17 unless there are only awards in 2016-17. The annual average for other postsecondary is for 2013-16.

# **Gap Analysis**

Calculating a traditional LMI gap does not seem to add any value to the decision to create a Wine Service program. There is projected to be about 103,000 bartenders, waitresses and waiters employed in 2022 in the region and about 7,800 in the sub-region. 89% of the annual openings in the region and sub-region are made up of those two SOC codes. So, it does not seem that there would be any issue on the demand side as long as employers and consequently students/workers (who wanted to add a new skill to advance or increase employment opportunities) saw value in getting a certificate in wine education. With only 451 annual awards in the region, supply does not seem to be an issue either.

#### **Student Outcomes**

Table 8. Four Employment Outcomes Metrics for Students Who Took Courses on TOP 1306.00 - Nutrition, Foods, and Culinary Arts.

Note: Student outcomes data is only available on this TOP code for Monterey since data for Cabrillo is suppressed because of the noumber of students matched is less than ten.

2015-16	Bay (All CTE Programs)	Cabrillo (All CTE Programs)	MPC (All CTE Programs)	<b>State</b> (130600)	<b>Bay</b> (130600)	SC- Monterey (130600)	MPC (130600)	Top College the regio students wi me	n (no. of
% Employed Four Quarters After Exit	74%	70%	78%	66%	70%	62%	58%	Mission	81% (46 students)
Median Earnings Two Quarters After Exit	\$10,310	\$8,390	\$18,620	\$6,030	\$8,880	\$6,835	\$4,910	San Francisco	\$9,765
Median % Change in Earnings	46%	54%	25%	55%	37%	45%	54%	San Francisco	83% (27 students)
% of Students Earning a Living Wage	63%	55%	73%	41%	46%	22%	14%	San Francisco	59% (17 students)

Source: Launchboard Pipeline (version available on 5/14/18)

### Skills, Certificates and Education

Table 9. Top Skills for Wine and Wine Service Occupations in Bay Region (May 2017 - April 2018)

Skill	Postings	Skill	Postings	Skill	Postings
Restaurant Management	2,309	Cooking	418	Business Acumen	169
Scheduling	1,539	Restaurant Operations	416	Profit Targets	164
Guest Services	1,467	Asset Protection	412	Inventory Control	163
Teamwork/Collaboration	1,397	Food Delivery	386	Quality Assurance & Control	159
Bartending	1,294	Customer Contact	379	Teaching	155
Food Safety	1,245	Food Preparation	373	Store Management	142
Budgeting	1,216	Purchasing	372	Product Availability	141
White and Wine Service (	Occup la ins	in 12 County Bay Region and	d in SC-Monte	ey, 2018 Page	<b>7</b> of

Customer Service	1,132	Performance Analysis	346	Banquet Event Orders (BEOs)	138
Cleaning	875	Supervisory Skills	337	Administrative Functions	137
Food Service Experience	737	Performance Appraisals	315	Operations Management	137
Cash Handling	647	Allergies	250	Service Improvement	135
Staff Management	644	Food Service Industry Knowledge	249	Training Programs	135
Lifting Ability	621	Hospitality Industry Knowledge	231	Inventory Maintenance	132
Customer Checkout	618	Product Sales	229	Office Administration	132
Quality Management	613	Team Management	229	Sales Goals	132
Retail Industry Knowledge	588	Performance Management	228	Food Safety and Quality	125
Sales	556	Inventory Management	215	Restaurant Industry Knowledge	120
Restaurant Experience	51 <i>7</i>	Conflict Management	210	Office Supply Ordering	119
Point of Sale System	516	Event Planning	189	Procurement	119
Safety Training	456	Employee Training	1 <i>77</i>	Upselling Products & Services	118
Basic Mathematics	445	Accounting	176	Business Administration	116

Source: Burning Glass

#### Table 10. Certifications for Wine and Wine Service Occupations in the Bay Region (May 2017 - April 2018)

Note: 85% of records have been excluded because they do not include a certification. As a result, the chart below may not be representative of the full sample.

Certification	Postings	Certification	Postings
ServSafe	548	Food Service Certification	118
Food Handler Certification	423	Alcohol Server Certification	94
Driver's License	377	Alcohol Awareness Certification	77
Training For Intervention Procedures (TIPS) Certification	178	Certified Dietary Manager	54

Source: Burning Glass

## Table 11. Education Requirements for Wine and Wine Service Occupations in Bay Region

Note: 70% of records have been excluded because they do not include a degree level. As a result, the chart below may not be representative of the full sample.

Education (minimum advertised)	Latest 12 Mos. Postings		
High school or vocational training	1,965 (68%)		
Associate Degree	213 (8%)		
Bachelor's Degree or Higher	712 (24%)		

Source: Burning Glass

# Methodology

Occupations for this report were identified by use of skills listed in O\*Net descriptions and job descriptions in Burning Glass. Labor demand data is sourced from Economic Modeling Specialists International (EMSI) occupation data and Burning Glass job postings data. Educational supply and student outcomes data is retrieved from multiple sources, including CTE Launchboard and CCCCO Data Mart.

#### **Sources**

O\*Net Online

Labor Insight/Jobs (Burning Glass)

Economic Modeling Specialists International (EMSI)

CTE LaunchBoard <u>www.calpassplus.org/Launchboard/</u>

Statewide CTE Outcomes Survey

Employment Development Department Unemployment Insurance Dataset

Living Insight Center for Community Economic Development

Chancellor's Office MIS system

#### Contacts

For more information, please contact:

- Karen Beltramo, Data Research Analyst, for Bay Area Community College Consortium (BACCC) and Centers of Excellence (CoE), karen@baccc.net or (831) 332-1253
- John Carrese, Director, San Francisco Bay Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research, <u>jcarrese@ccsf.edu</u>
   Wine and Wine Service Occupations in 12 County Bay Region and in SC-Monterey, 2018
   Page 9 of